

PERSPECTIVES
ON COMPREHENSIVE EDUCATION SERIES

Series Edited by
Hervé Varenne and Edmund W. Gordon

Volume Three

PERSPECTIVES ON COMPREHENSIVE EDUCATION SERIES

1. Hervé Varenne (Editor)

Alternative Anthropological Perspectives on Education

2. Hervé Varenne and Edmund W. Gordon (Editors)

Theoretical Perspectives on Comprehensive Education: The Way Forward

3. Linda J. Lin, Edmund W. Gordon, and Hervé Varenne (Editors)

Educating Comprehensively: Varieties of Educational Experiences

EDUCATING COMPREHENSIVELY:
VARIETIES OF EDUCATIONAL EXPERIENCES

Edited by
Linda J. Lin, Edmund W. Gordon
and Hervé Varenne

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Perspectives on comprehensive education series/ edited by Hervé Varenne and Edmund W. Gordon.

Vol. 3 has title: Educating comprehensively: Varieties of educational experiences

All rights reserved. For information contact

The Edwin Mellen Press
Box 450
Lewiston, New York
USA 14092-0450

The Edwin Mellen Press
Box 67
Queenston, Ontario
CANADA L0S 1L0

The Edwin Mellen Press, Ltd.
Lampeter, Ceredigion, Wales
UNITED KINGDOM SA48 8LT

Printed in the United States of America

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword to the Series	i
Acknowledgements	iii

INTRODUCTION

1	LINDA J. LIN	1
	Expanding Educational Thought	

PART I FROM THEORY TO PRACTICE : COMPREHENSIVE APPROACHES TO EDUCATION

2	JAMES G. GREENO	19
	Framing Intellectual Identities, Intellectual Characters, and Epistemic Values	
3	MESHA L. ELLIS AND RONALD BRAITHWAITE	43
	Targeting Literacy to Address Educationally Relevant Health Disparities	
4	DAVID W. RICE, BRENDA WALL, WILLIAM M. HAYES, AND THE MOREHOUSE COLLEGE IDENTITY ORCHESTRATION LAB	69
	Black Males, “Church” and Supplementary Education: General Considerations	
5	EZEKIEL J. DIXON-ROMÁN	95
	Inheritance and an Economy of Difference: The Importance of Supplementary Education,	
6	V. P. FRANKLIN	113
	Opportunities Industrialization Centers: Collective Cultural Capital, Philanthropy, and Public-Private Partnerships in the Provision of Supplementary Education,	

- 7 CAROL BONILLA BOWMAN AND EDMUND W. GORDON 131
The Eagle Academy for Young Men: An Exemplar of the
Comprehensive Practice of Education
- 8 BETINA JEAN-LOUIS, KATHERINE SHOEMAKER AND
EDMUND W. GORDON 161
The Harlem Children’s Zone: An “All Hands on Deck” Approach
to Transforming Education and Community

PART II
IRREPRESSIBLE AND UNTAMABLE:
EDUCATION AS HUMAN ACTIVITY

- 9 JILL P. KOYAMA 189
'Supplemental Educational Services': NCLB's Extended School
Day
- 10 ANGELA BOOKER 209
Framing Youth Civic Participation: Technical, Pragmatic, and
Political Learning
- 11 LINDA J. LIN 233
Education in Harlem Community Gardens: Reorganizing Social
Conditions
- 12 LEE MARTIN AND SHELLEY GOLDMAN 257
Family Inheritance: Parallel Practices of Financial Responsibility
in Families
- 13 MICHELE VERMA 281
Becoming (Known as) a Hindu *Pandit* in Queens
- 14 ERNESTO “TLAHUITOLLINI” COLÍN 305
A Modern Mexica Paideia: Learning through the Construction
of a *Calpulli*

AFTERWORD

- | | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 15 | HERVÉ VARENNE
Facing the Power of Education, Comprehensively | 337 |
| 16 | PAOLA HEINKE AND EDMUND W. GORDON
A Re-Conceptualization of Education | 355 |

FOREWORD

by

Hervé Varenne and Edmund W. Gordon

This is the third in a series of three volumes intended to explore educational processes in the broadest manner and from a variety of disciplinary orientations. Together, we are challenging each other and those interested in our approach to answer a difficult question that educational research has never quite answered satisfactorily: what sort of research should one conduct if one takes seriously the common idea that education is a much broader process than it is made to be when one takes schooling as the paradigmatic institution of education?

It is easy for people to agree that schools are but one of the many institutions, settings, or moments when all of us, as children, adolescents and adults, educate ourselves and each other about what is most important in our lives. It has been much more difficult for researchers to transform this easy consensus into a program of research and it remains extremely difficult to transform this consensus into policies and programs. It has been about impossible to escape the circle that starts with celebrating the individual child and ends labeling this child as deficient in this or that way. And it has been about impossible not to end advocating policies for the remediation of deficiencies that then become more or less benign bureaucracies requiring of their clients that they accept the label as valid.

We share the hope that something can be done to help those left less well developed by the limited exploitation of education more broadly defined. As researchers, teachers, counselors, and administrators in schools of education, we are deeply committed to using our positions to understand the conditions that produce human underdevelopment, and then to advocate for policies that may change these conditions. But we are also quite skeptical of what our peers in academia and politics have produced. We are convinced, on the basis of long careers that we must all try again to recast our work in terms of what we can now see as a systematic blindness to what may be most powerful in the education of people.

This series of three volumes builds on and develop an earlier volume edited by Edmund W. Gordon, Beatrice L. Bridglall, and Aundra Saa Meroe, *Supplementary Education: The hidden curriculum of high academic achievement* (2005). In that volume, the editors make the case for the

complementarities between the teaching and learning that occur in schools, and the learning and teaching that occur in life. Having made that argument, the balance of the book is devoted to the elaboration of examples from practice and evaluation of the current state of the field.

All volumes bring together scholars from many disciplines willing to work on the needed recasting of the systematic study of education. Each volume has a distinct orientation. This first volume is a sample of work by young scholars in anthropology coming together to illustrate the kinds of human activity which any theory of education should take into account. The second volume brings together more senior scholars from across the spectrum of the behavioral sciences. They were charged to imagine what a review of the literature might look like, twenty years hence if the research we are calling for had been conducted. We hope that volume will serve as a “call for proposals” that will take future scholars into areas were few have gone before. The third volume will consist of reports on just the kind of research that we are calling for.

The senior editors came to the task of putting together these volumes from quite different, though broadly related, experiences. Edmund W. Gordon, emeritus professor from Teachers College and Yale University, has kept searching for the programs for children and youths who live in difficult conditions that are grounded in some of the best research in the behavioral sciences. He has looked for better answers through his experience in the practical and conceptual exploration of a wide variety of theoretical formulations. Along both routes we see the limitations of more narrow ways of thinking about education. Hervé Varenne, as anthropologist and professor of education at Teachers College, has been concerned with identifying what makes the most difference in teaching and learning for the people of the United States, both through ethnographic work in small towns, high schools, and families, and also through a continual rethinking of theories of culture and education. Gordon and Varenne started a fruitful collaboration as they discovered a convergence in their interest. They convened a “Study Group on Comprehensive Education” that brings together scholars from all over the United States to discuss broader ways of thinking about educational research, practice and policy. These volumes are part of the overall effort.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We wish to thank most sincerely, all those who participated in this project. This includes all our colleagues who encouraged us, and critiqued our work. The participants in the meetings of the National Study Group on Supplementary Education deserve special mention for they truly energized us to continue working. Some of the participants contributed the papers who are now included in this volume. We owe a special debt of gratitude to them.

The Study Group is also indebted to the College Board, Educational Testing Service (ETS), Teachers College, Columbia University, the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation and the W. T. Grant Foundation for the financial support that made this work possible.